

**DEALING WITH LANGUAGE VARIATION IN A SOURCE TEXT:  
*MALAY SKETCHES* AND ITS MALAY TRANSLATION**

Haslina Haroon

Translation and Interpreting Studies Section, School of Humanities,  
Universiti Sains Malaysia, 11800 Minden, Penang, Malaysia.

E-mail: [haslina@usm.my](mailto:haslina@usm.my)

Received: 02.03.2024

Accepted: 22.06.2024

**ABSTRACT**

**Background and Purpose:** Although translation generally involves the transfer of meaning from the source language (L1) to the target language (L2), it may also involve a third language or L3, that is, any other language(s) found in either the source or target text. Language variation in a source text presents a challenge to translators, as they need to deal with both L1 and L3. This paper aims to explore the issue of language variation in a source text to see how L3 is rendered in translation. More specifically, the aim is to explore how L3 segments in French, Latin and Italian in a text in English entitled *Malay Sketches* are dealt with when the text is translated into Malay, and to determine the effects resulting from the solutions taken by the translators.

**Methodology:** L3 in *Malay Sketches* are first identified. These L3 segments are subsequently mapped to their counterparts in the Malay translation, *Gelagat & Ragam Orang Melayu*. This mapping results in source language-target language pairs, which are then analysed to determine the solutions taken by the translators. These solutions are categorised based on the framework of translation solutions in L3 translation by Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011).

**Findings:** It was found that L3 translation generally involves substitution in which L3 is translated into Malay. Consequently, language variation, a defining feature of the source text, becomes invisible in the Malay translation.

**Contributions:** This study hopes to contribute to and expand current discourse on L3 in translation, especially in view of the fact that scant attention had been paid to L3 translation in Malaysia.

**Keywords:** *Malay Sketches*, language variation, multilingual text, third language, translation.

**Cite as:** Haroon, H. (2024). Dealing with language variation in a source text: *Malay Sketches* and its Malay translation. *Journal of Nusantara Studies*, 9(2), 537-556.  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.24200/jonus.vol9iss2pp537-556>

## 1.0 INTRODUCTION

Translation is generally understood as “the changing of an original written text (the source text, or ST) in the original verbal language (the source language, or SL) into a written text (the target text, or TT) in a different verbal language (the target language, or TL)” (Munday et al., 2022, p. 8). The source language is also commonly referred to as L1, and the target language L2. Translation therefore involves the transfer of meaning from L1 to L2.

Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011), however, note that besides L1 and L2, translation may also involve L3, which refers to any other language(s) found in either the source text or the target text, although more commonly in the source text. Texts which employ the use of more than one language are referred to as multilingual texts. They are “not bilingual publications that involve repeating the same message in two different languages, like a bilingual edition of the Constitution of Canada in French and English, but rather texts where some parts of the message of a text are in one language and other parts are in another” (Zabalbeascoa & Voellmer, 2014, p. 51). A multilingual source text in the context of translation is therefore a source text that is made up of a combination of languages, where L1 is the primary language and L3 the secondary language. L3 in the source text (ST) is referred to by Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011) as L3<sup>ST</sup>.

Examples of works written in English but interspersed with words from other languages abound. In Francisco Sionil José’s masterpiece *Ermita*, the readers are told that Conchita and Felicitas Rojo “had enough rice even when it became difficult to transport it from the haciendas in Nueva Ecija. Ten cavans were still in the attic but their encargado had not come in weeks” (José, 1988, p. 6). Meanwhile, in *A Thousand Splendid Suns*, Khaled Hosseini provides a description of the house owned by Rasheed, the husband of the main character, Mariam: “Rasheed’s house was smaller than Jalil’s, but, compared to Mariam and Nana’s *kolba*, it was a mansion. There was a hallway, a living room downstairs, and a kitchen in which he showed

her pots and pans and a pressure cooker and a kerosene *ishtop*” (Hosseini, 2008, p. 57). Following Grutman’s (2000) statement that “the presence of a single loanword can theoretically be considered a minimal requirement for a text to be identified as multilingual” (p. 158), both *Ermita* and *A Thousand Splendid Suns* can be considered as multilingual texts. The non-English words in both texts are clear examples of L3<sup>ST</sup>. Clearly, not all texts are exclusively monolingual.

Translation is fraught with difficulties, even when it involves the transfer of meaning from L1 in a monolingual text to L2. With a multilingual source text, the transfer is doubly complicated. Some of the questions that need to be considered are: If foreign words are deliberately placed in the source text by the author in order to achieve a particular effect or accomplish a particular goal, should the translator strive for the same effect and goal? However, if we subscribe to the belief that the main aim of a translation is to convey meaning which otherwise would not be accessible by the target readers, does this imply that the translator should assist the readers in crossing linguistic and cultural boundaries by erasing all traces of the foreign in the translation? Can L3<sup>ST</sup> be retained in the translated text? More importantly, should it be retained? These are perhaps some of the concerns raised by Bellos (2008) in his article entitled ‘The Awkward Issue of L3’. While he acknowledges the relations between L1 and L2 in translation, Bellos (2008) also asks the following:

But what if a third language, L3, is involved? Asking how to deal with Latin tags in French texts translated into English, for instance, or Yiddish words in American English for translation into German, may seem like a diversion or an irrelevance. But however quirky and curious specific L3 problems may be, the question of what to do about language in T1 that is not L1 raises issues that are central to the phenomena that Translation Studies seeks to study. And it raises them in a way that makes the standard approaches to translation practice and theory quite problematic. (p. 114)

Zabalbeascoa and Voellmer (2014) appear to echo the views of Bellos (2008) when they state that “language variation within a text is a phenomenon which translation theory does not have many answers for, despite the many case-study publications on the matter” (p. 26). This paper, therefore, hopes to contribute to the ongoing discussion on this issue. It aims to explore the issue of language variation in a source text in order to see how L3 is rendered in translation. More specifically, the aim is to explore how L3 in a text in English text entitled *Malay Sketches*

is dealt with when the text is translated into Malay. Additionally, the paper also aims to explore the effects resulting from the solutions taken by the translators.

## 2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW

The crux of this study is the issue of language variation in a source text. While Grutman (2000) uses the term ‘multilingual text’ to refer to a text which employs the use of more than one language, the term ‘heterolingual’ is also often used, for instance, by Voellmer (2014), who defines a heterolingual text as “one that combines different languages (e.g., English, French, and Italian) or that displays intralingual variation (diatopical, diastratical and diaphasical), or both” (pp. 153-154). That language variation in a source text is an issue worthy of academic discussion is reflected in Grutman’s (2006) statement that “texts foregrounding different languages pose unusual challenges for translators and translation scholars alike” (p. 17).

The third language, or L3 in translation, refers to “any language or type of linguistic variation that is significant and distinguishable from L1 in the ST, and/or from L2 in the TT. It is unlike L1 and L2 in that it accounts for a relatively (or very) small number of words” (Zabalbeascoa & Voellmer, 2014, p. 43). Thus, L3 is any language, besides L1 and L2, which is also present in the source text.

Because of the challenge posed by L3 in translation, scholars in the field of Translation Studies have attempted to explore this issue in depth. Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011), for instance, put forward a number of solutions in dealing with L3, particularly in film translation. Translation to L2 involving L3 in the source text can be represented as  $L1 + L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2 + L3^{TT}$ . L3 thus may also appear in the translation and can become the third language in the target text ( $L3^{TT}$ ). The third language in the source text ( $L3^{ST}$ ) can be dealt with in the following ways:

- 1) The third language in the ST can be deleted altogether in the translation. Consequently, L3 will no longer be visible in L2;
- 2) The third language in the ST can be repeated or retained in the translation, if the third language is not the same as the language of the translation (L2). The third language is thus unchanged, and L2 will have a third language ( $L3^{TT}$ );
- 3) The third language in the ST can be substituted with the language of the translation, if the third language is not the same as the language of the translation (L2). In this case, it will be neutralised and will no longer be visible as a third language in the translation;

- 4) The third language in the ST can be repeated or retained in the translation, if the third language is the same as the language of the translation (L2). In this case, it will be also neutralised and will no longer be visible as a third language in the translation;
- 5) The third language in the ST can be substituted with some other language, besides L2 and L3<sup>ST</sup>. It might even be substituted with L1. In this case, the third language in the ST is adapted and becomes visible as a third language in the translation (L3<sup>TT</sup>).

The operations above, which generally involve deletion of L3 (case 1), retention of L3 (cases 2 and 4), and substitution of L3 (cases 3 and 5), are summarised in Table 1.

Table 1: Operations for L3<sup>ST</sup> segments (Corrius & Zabalbeascoa, 2011)

No.	Operation	L3 <sup>TT</sup> segment	L3 <sup>TT</sup> status
1	delete L3 <sup>ST</sup>	∅	lost
2	repeat L3 <sup>ST</sup> → L3 <sup>TT</sup> (when L3 <sup>ST</sup> ≠ L2)	L3 <sup>TT</sup> = L3 <sup>ST</sup>	kept
3	substitute L3 <sup>ST</sup> → L2 (when L3 <sup>ST</sup> ≠ L2)	∅	lost
4	repeat L3 <sup>ST</sup> (when L3 <sup>ST</sup> = L2)	L3 <sup>TT</sup> = L2	lost
5	substitute L3 <sup>ST</sup>	L3 <sup>TT</sup> ≠ L3 <sup>ST</sup> L3 <sup>TT</sup> ≠ L2  L3 <sup>TT</sup> ≠ L1 L3 <sup>TT</sup> = L1	kept

Studies that have been carried out thus far to explore the issue of L3 in translation point to the use of various operations or solutions in dealing with L3<sup>ST</sup>. In their analysis of three multilingual movies in English which include L3 such as French, German, Italian and Japanese, and their dubbed versions in Persian, Ebrahimzadeh Poustchi and Amirian (2021), relying on the framework of operations for L3 segments as proposed by Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011), found that the most frequent operation used was the substitution of L3 with L2, resulting in a linguistically homogeneous translation. Khoshsaligheh et al. (2024) likewise looked into the

issue of L3 in multilingual films, focusing on ten multilingual films and their dubbed Persian versions. Their findings are similar to that of Ebrahimzadeh Poustchi and Amirian (2021) in that neutralisation is employed in translating L3, thus eliminating linguistic variation in the resulting dubbed versions. Golchinnezhad and Amirian (2022) also explored the issue of L3 in multilingual films in the Iranian context, but what sets this study apart from the previous studies carried out in the Iranian context is that the L3 in the study by Golchinnezhad and Amirian (2022) are invented languages. Also employing the model proposed by Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011), the study found that the most frequent operation employed in dealing with L3 in the form of invented languages was repetition of L3 in the translation. Taking into account the findings of the study by Ebrahimzadeh Poustchi and Amirian (2021) in which the substitution of L3 with L2 was found to be more frequently used, Golchinnezhad and Amirian (2022) suggest that the nature of the L3, i.e. whether natural or invented, might affect the operations employed.

While these studies clearly focus on L3 in audiovisual texts, L3 may also in fact be employed in printed texts. In the Malaysian context, the issue of language variation in a printed source text has been explored in a study by Haroon and Daud (2017). Specifically, they examined L3 in Pashto and Dari in a novel in English entitled *A Thousand Splendid Suns*, and the translation of the L3 into Malay. It was found that the L3 words are mostly retained in the Malay translation, in the same way that L3 in the form of invented languages are repeated in their dubbed versions in Persian in the study by Golchinnezhad and Amirian (2022). The use of the procedure of retention means that the resulting translation in Malay retain the multilingual features of the source text. As we can see from this brief review of related literature, L3 may be treated differently in translation, with the treatment employed determining the extent to which language variation can be observed in the resulting translation.

The next section will now focus on the method of this study. This will be followed by the findings based on the analysis carried out.

### **3.0 RESEARCH DESIGN**

This study focuses on the third language in the source text, or L3<sup>ST</sup>. More specifically, the focus is on words in any language other than L1 (English) or L2 (Malay) which are also present in the source text in English. It is necessary to first introduce the sources of data in this study before explanation is provided as to how the study was carried out.

The source text, *Malay Sketches* (MS), was written by Frank Athelstane Swettenham (1850-1946), a British colonial administrator who spent almost 35 years in the Civil Service in

Malaya. It was first published in 1895 by The Bodley Head, London. *MS* is described by Swettenham as “a series of sketches of Malay scenery and Malay character drawn by one who has spent the best part of his life in the scenes and amongst the people” (1895, p. vii). In this study, the third edition of *MS* published in 1903 is referred to for the relevant excerpts.

Although written in English, *MS* is also characterised by the use of a variety of other languages, Malay being one of them. This is not surprising considering that Swettenham was writing about Malaya. The inclusion of Malay words, most of which are culture-specific references, thus contributes to giving the text local colour. The following excerpt illustrates the use of Malay words in *MS*.

I had gone to Pahang on a political mission accompanied by a friend, and we were vainly courting sleep in a miserable lodging, when at 1 A.M. a message came from the Sultan inviting us to witness a *joget*. We accepted with alacrity, and at once made our way to the *astana*, a picturesque, well-built and commodious house on the right bank of the Pahang river. (Swettenham, 1903, pp. 45-46)

All the Malay words in *MS* are marked in italics. *MS* also includes words and expressions from other languages, which are also clearly marked in *MS* in italics, as shown in the following: “The *laudator temporis acti* is a common and flourishing plant in Malaya” (Swettenham, 1903, pp. 189-190).

Although all non-English words in *MS* are marked in italics, this study is interested only in L3 in the source text other than those in Malay. This is based on the explanation given by Zabalbeascoa and Voellmer (2014) that L3 is “distinguishable from L1 in the ST, and/or from L2 in the TT” (p. 43). L3 is therefore any language, besides L1 and L2, which is also present in the source text. Thus, Malay words in *MS* are not taken into account as the L2 in this case is Malay. Additionally, it is noted that in the Malay translation of *MS*, words originally in Malay in the English source text unsurprisingly do not undergo any change. If we employ the model proposed by Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011), we can see that in the case of *MS*, one of the L3 is the same as the L2 (refer to case 4). It is not surprising, therefore, that the L3 is repeated, as can be observed from the excerpts in Table 2. It must be noted that in the examples provided in this paper which show the excerpts from both *MS* and its translation, ‘ST’ is used to refer to the English source text, *Malay Sketches*, while ‘TT’ is used to refer to the translated text in Malay, *Gelagat & Ragam Orang Melayu*.

Table 2: The rendition of Malay words in *Malay Sketches*

ST	TT
It is usual for the men, when sliding down the rock, to sit upon a piece of the thick fibre of the plantain called <i>upih</i> . (p. 35)	Bagi orang lelaki pula, sudah menjadi kebiasaan mereka menggeluncur dengan duduk di atas <i>upih</i> . (p. 23)
In either cheek a dimple, <i>lesong mati</i> , as the Malays call it, the dimple which so fascinates the beholder that it will lure him even unto death. (p. 180)	Di kedua-dua belah pipinya ada “ <i>lesung mati</i> ” yang sungguh mempesona hingga menggoda orang yang melihatnya hingga mati. (p. 119)

It is evident here that the Malay words used in *MS* are retained in the Malay translation, with little or no change at all. With other L3 in *MS*, however, the translator is believed to have more options at his/her disposal. It is these translation options or solutions, and their implications, which the researcher is interested in and which are the core focus of this study.

To carry out the study, all L3 segments in the English source text (ST), apart from those in Malay, are first identified. Following this, a mapping of these foreign words and expressions to their counterparts in the Malay translation or target text (TT) is carried out. The Malay translation titled *Gelagat & Ragam Orang Melayu* was published in 2022 by IBDE Ilham, Kuala Lumpur and was translated by Ahmad Zamani Ishak and Norziati Rosman. This mapping results in ST-TT pairs which are then analysed to determine the solutions taken by the translators in dealing with language variation in *MS*. The solutions are then categorised based on the framework of translation solutions in L3 translation by Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011).

#### 4.0 ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

Through the analysis carried out, this study has identified a total of 26 L3 words and expressions in the ST, i.e. from French (19), Latin (6), and Italian (1), as shown in Table 3. Following Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011), it can be said that *MS* is made up of a combination of L1 and L3<sup>ST</sup>, where L1 is English and L3<sup>ST</sup> includes Malay, French, Latin and Italian (source text = L1<sup>English</sup> + L3<sup>Malay</sup> + L3<sup>French</sup> + L3<sup>Latin</sup> + L3<sup>Italian</sup>). These L3<sup>ST</sup> non-English words are all marked in italics in *MS*.

The mapping of these L3 words and expressions to their counterparts in the Malay translation results in a list (see Appendix 1), which can be analysed to determine the solutions taken by the translators. In the following discussion, how the translators deal with L3<sup>ST</sup> is

examined by looking at each foreign language separately, based on the opinion that “the inclusion of more than one language in a single text [...] does not necessarily entail translating each language in the same way, and by the same means (solution-types)” (Corrius & Zabalbeascoa, 2011, p. 125).

Table 3: L3 words and expressions in *Malay Sketches* and their origin

FRENCH	LATIN	ITALIAN
<i>mésalliances</i>	<i>post-mortem</i>	<i>terra cotta</i>
<i>bouille-abaisse</i>	<i>opium cum dignitate</i>	
<i>venue</i>	<i>spretæ injuria formæ</i>	
<i>sujets</i>	<i>laudator temporis acti</i>	
<i>liaison</i>	<i>modus operandi</i>	
<i>métier</i>	<i>terra incognita</i>	
<i>dénouement</i>		
<i>impasse</i>		
<i>hors de combat</i>		
<i>séance</i>		
<i>hauteur</i>		
<i>suave</i>		
<i>rôle</i>		
<i>cordon</i>		
<i>mêlée</i>		
<i>qui vive</i>		
<i>en evidence</i>		
<i>en masse</i>		
<i>rose dorée</i>		

#### 4.1 French Words in *MS*

Out of the 19 French words in *MS*, only three are repeated or retained in the Malay translation. It must be noted, however, that the three French words which are retained are all treated differently by the translators.

One way the French word is retained is shown in the example in Table 4.

Table 4: Retention of L3 without providing the meaning

ST	TT
...there was the strange power of hypnotising, influencing and awakening certain <i>sujets</i> whose nervous organisations seem to be specially susceptible, and there was the astonishing influence of the magnet over these same <i>sujets</i> when already hypnotised. (p. 64)	Terdapat penggunaan pukau yang aneh, yang mempengaruhi dan menyedarkan beberapa <i>sujets</i> tertentu yang menjadikan organisasi saraf kelihatan seperti mudah terdedah. Terdapat pengaruh yang menakjubkan oleh magnet terhadap <i>sujets</i> yang sama apabila dia telah dipukau. (p. 45)

This excerpt is taken from Chapter 9 of *MS* which focuses on the startle reflex known in the Malay world as '*latah*'. Swettenham began the chapter by recounting his experience in a hospital in Paris where he witnessed patients being treated for disorders of the nervous system. These patients were referred to by Swettenham using the French word "*sujets*". "*Sujet*", the singular form of "*sujets*", may carry various different meanings; in this context, however, it refers to 'a thing, person or circumstance suitable for, or requiring, a particular kind of treatment, reaction etc' (Cambridge University Press, 2014c). As evident in the Malay translation, the French word "*sujets*" is retained in the Malay translation. No explanation, however, is provided for the meaning of the French word which is kept in the Malay translation.

In the second case, the translators opted for the retention of the French word but with a slight variation. Unlike in the previous example in which the L3 is retained with no accompanying explanatory detail, in the second case the L3 that is retained appears together with some explanation regarding its meaning. This is illustrated in the example in Table 5.

Table 5: Retention of L3 with the addition of footnote

ST	TT
Some one has smuggled in a few condiments and they add largely to the success of the Malay <i>bouille-abaisse</i> , but people affect not to know they are there, and you go away assured that rice and salt did it all. (p. 22)	Namun begitu, ada juga antara mereka yang diam-diam memasukkan bumbu yang lain ke dalam <i>bouille-abaisse</i> ala Melayu ini dan orang yang menikmatinya tidak tahu adanya bumbu asing yang ditambah. (p. 15)

This excerpt which is taken from Chapter 2 centres on the Malay picnic which involves catching fish for lunch and preparing what is referred to by Swettenham as the "Malay *bouille-abaisse*". The word "*bouille-abaisse*", or more accurately "*bouillabaisse*", refers generally to

‘fish stew’ (Cambridge University Press, 2018a). In the Malay translation, the French word “*bouille-abaisse*” is retained and marked in italics, and is accompanied by an explanation in the form of a footnote. Footnote 1 explains to the readers that “*bouille-abaisse*” is “*sup daripada campuran pelbagai jenis ikan*” (lit. soup made from a combination of various types of fish). This strategy of specifying the meaning of a word to readers by means of additional details placed outside the text, i.e. in a footnote, endnote or glossary, is also known in the field of Translation Studies as extratextual gloss (Franco Aixelá, 1996).

Besides adding explanatory notes outside the text, a translator may also include notes within the text itself. In the Malay translation of *MS*, this solution was also taken by the translators, as seen from the excerpts in Table 6.

Table 6: Retention of L3 with intratextual gloss

ST	TT
For a little while there was great excitement, and then the King recovered consciousness, was carried to a side verandah and a quantity of cold water poured over him. So ended the <i>séance</i> . (p. 159)	Buat beberapa ketika, sultan berada dalam keadaan seperti bersawai. Tidak lama kemudian, baginda kembali waras dan dibawa ke beranda lalu direnjis air sejuk. Maka, tamatlah <i>séance</i> atau <b>upacara puja semangat untuk berbicara</b> . (p. 106)

This excerpt from Chapter 14 describes the Malay performance or ritual of ‘*berhantu*’, which means “to raise the devil” (Swettenham, 1903, p. 152). More specifically, the performance was carried out to cure an ailing Sultan. The French word “*séance*”, which refers to ‘a session when something is done’ (Cambridge University Press, 2014a), is used in *MS* to refer to a session which involves summoning the spirits and communicating with them (Cambridge University Press, 2014b). As can be seen in Table 6, the word “*séance*” is not only retained in the Malay translation but it is also accompanied by its meaning, which is “*upacara puja semangat untuk berbicara*” (lit. a ceremony which involves worshipping the spirits for the purpose of communication). As opposed to the example in Table 5 in which explanatory details are placed outside the text, the explanation in this example is weaved into the text, a strategy also known as intratextual gloss (Franco Aixelá, 1996).

Besides employing the procedure of retention, the translators also rely on the procedure of substitution. In fact, this procedure is applied in 13 of the 19 French words found in *MS*. Through the use of substitution, the L3 itself is not carried across into the Malay translation.

Its meaning, however, is successfully conveyed in the Malay translation through the provision of an equivalent or approximate word or expression in Malay. The excerpts in Table 7 illustrate one example of the use of substitution.

Table 7: Substitution of L3

ST	TT
A large hole was rent in the floor, and, the various missiles scattering in all directions, one of them struck Haji Musah in the thigh, seriously wounding him and placing him <i>hors de combat</i> . (p. 130)	Tembakan itu menyebabkan sebuah lubang besar terbentuk di lantai rumah. Peluru penabur yang dilepaskan bertaburan ke segenap arah. Salah satu paku daripada penabur itu terkena paha Haji Musa. Dia mengalami luka yang parah lantas <b>tiada daya lagi melawan semula</b> . (p. 88)

Taken from Chapter 13 entitled ‘The Passing of Penglina Prang Semaun’, this excerpt centres on the fight between Haji Musah/Musa and Penglina Prang Semaun/Panglima Perang Semaun. Irrked by Haji Musah’s continuous refusal to surrender, Penglina Prang Semaun loaded a pivot-gun and used it to attack Haji Musah. One of the missiles subsequently wounded Haji Musah and rendered him “*hors de combat*”. The French expression “*hors de combat*” is used by Swettenham to refer to a situation in which one is out of action due to injury (Cambridge University Press, 2020a). As evident in the Malay translation, this expression is removed and replaced with its approximate meaning in Malay, i.e. “*tiada daya lagi melawan semula*” (lit. unable to fight back).

Another example of substitution can be seen in the example in Table 8.

Table 8: Substitution of L3

ST	TT
Malays are extremely particular about questions of rank and birth, especially when it comes to marriage, and <i>mésalliances</i> , as understood in the West, are with them very rare. (p. 8)	Orang Melayu sangat mengambil berat akan kedudukan pangkat dan keturunan terutamanya apabila melibatkan perkahwinan, manakala <b>perkahwinan yang tidak sekufu</b> seperti yang difahami Barat, bagi mereka sangat jarang-jarang berlaku. (p. 5)

In this excerpt taken from Chapter 1 of *MS* entitled ‘The Real Malay’, Swettenham focuses on characteristics of the Malay people. According to Swettenham, the Malays try as much as possible to avoid “*mésalliances*”, which refers to marriage to a person from a lower rank or class (Cambridge University Press, 2018c). The French word is again not retained in the Malay translation and is replaced with its meaning in Malay, i.e. “*perkahwinan yang tidak sekufu*” (lit. marriage with a person from a different class or status).

Of the 19 French words in *MS*, three are deleted altogether. Through the use of the procedure of deletion, not only is the L3 word not retained in the Malay translation, its meaning is also not conveyed. One example of deletion is shown in the example in Table 9.

Table 9: Deletion of L3

ST	TT
I have said that this bravo, for that was his <i>métier</i> , was the henchman of the Raja Bendahara, the highest authority in the State after the Sultan. (p. 117)	Sebelum ini saya ada menyatakan bahawa Panglima Perang Semaun ialah pengikut Raja Bendahara yakni orang kedua penting selepas Sultan. (p. 80)

This excerpt, also taken from the chapter entitled ‘The Passing of Penglima Prang Semaun’, focuses on Penglima Prang Semaun himself, who was described as “one of the principal warriors in the country” (Swettenham, 1903, p. 115). He is known for his vile conduct, particularly in this case which involves a plan to eliminate the Orang Kaya Shabandar. It is for this reason that the excerpt in English refers to him as a “bravo”, meaning a villain or an assassin (Merriam-Webster, 2024a), and that that was his “*métier*” or profession (Cambridge University Press, 2018b). As can be observed in the Malay translation, the French word “*métier*” is not retained, nor is its meaning conveyed in the translation. The translators totally removed any reference to the work or profession of Penglima Prang Semaun as an assassin.

## 4.2 Latin Words in *Malay Sketches*

Latin words in *MS* are rendered into Malay using only the procedure of retention and substitution. Of the six Latin words in *MS*, only one is retained in the Malay translation, as illustrated in the example in Table 10.

Table 10: Retention of L3 with the addition of footnote

ST	TT
At that time the Malay Peninsula was a <i>terra incognita</i> to white men, and the characteristics, customs, peculiarities and prejudices of the Malay had yet to be learnt. (p. 228)	Pada masa itu, Semenanjung Tanah Melayu ialah sebuah <i>terra incognita</i> kepada orang kulit putih dengan ciri-ciri, adat istiadat dan praanggapan terhadap orang Melayu masih belum diketahui. (p. 149)

This excerpt from Chapter 19 focuses on James Wheeler Woodford Birch, his appointment as the adviser to the Sultan of Perak and his realisation, upon assuming duties, that “he had undertaken a well-nigh impossible task” (Swettenham, 1903, p. 228). That his task was said to be “well-nigh impossible” was largely due to the fact that at that time, the Malay Peninsula was “a *terra incognita* to white men”. The Latin phrase “*terra incognita*” here refers to “a place, subject, or situation that you are not familiar with” (Cambridge University Press, 2020b). As evident in the Malay translation, the translators opted to retain the expression “*terra incognita*” in their translation. The translators also included the meaning for this expression in a footnote. Footnote 20 tells the readers that “*terra incognita*” in this context refers to “*wilayah yang belum diketahui atau diterokai*” (lit. a region which is unknown and unexplored).

The rest of the Latin words in *MS* are translated using the procedure of substitution. This means that while the L3 itself is not carried across into the Malay translation, its meaning is successfully conveyed through a descriptive equivalent in Malay. In other words, the Latin expression is replaced with its meaning in the Malay translation. Table 11 illustrates one example of the use of substitution.

Table 11: Substitution of L3

ST	TT
As for Sleman and Maimunah, they were duly married, and she bore him a daughter in all respects like her mother, though not, the old people say, her peer in beauty. The <i>laudator temporis acti</i> is a common and flourishing plant in Malaya. (pp. 189-190)	Tentang Raja Sulaiman dan Raja Maimunah pula, mereka berkahwin dan dikurniakan seorang anak perempuan salin tak tumpah ibunya meskipun, kata orang dulu-dulu, tidak secantik siibu. Tapi sudah lumrah di Malaya, <b>orang menganggap yang lama lebih cantik daripada yang baru.</b> (pp. 125-126)

This excerpt from Chapter 16 entitled ‘A Malay romance’ centres on the affair between Raja Sleman/Sulaiman and the beautiful Raja Maimunah, wife of Raja Iskander/Iskandar. Raja Iskander eventually divorced his unfaithful wife, leaving her free to marry Raja Sleman. Raja Sleman and Raja Maimunah were eventually blessed with a daughter, who was not nearly as beautiful as her mother. Swettenham succinctly describes this situation in *MS* using the Latin expression “*laudator temporis acti*”, which means “one who praises past times” (Merriam-Webster, 2024b) or “a praiser of times past (i.e. one who prefers the good old days)” (European Dictionary, 2024). In the context of this excerpt, it refers to preference for the beauty of Raja Maimunah compared to that of her daughter. This Latin expression is not retained at all in the Malay translation. In fact, it is substituted with its meaning, i.e. “*orang menganggap yang lama lebih cantik daripada yang baru*” (lit. people consider the older one much more beautiful than the new one).

The use of this procedure can also be seen in the example in Table 12.

Table 12: Substitution of L3

ST	TT
... but he recognised that boys will be boys, and if the young Selangor Rajas took their pleasure in this way, he was inclined to regard their escapades with an indulgent eye, provided they did not interfere with his <i>opium cum dignitate</i> and his immediate surroundings. (p. 104)	Namun, baginda faham anak muda memang berdarah panas. Maka kalau para pembesar Selangor lebih memilih perang, baginda cenderung membiarkan mereka menurut kehendak hati selagi <b>istirahat dan kesenangan</b> baginda serta persekitarannya tidak diganggu. (p. 71)

Taken from Chapter 12, entitled ‘Van Hagen and Cavaliero’, this excerpt focuses on Sultan Abdul Samad, the fourth Sultan of Selangor, whose penchant for opium smoking was widely known. The Latin phrase “*opium cum dignitate*” as used in this excerpt, is actually a play on the Latin phrase “*otium cum dignitate*”, which means “leisure with dignity” (Merriam-Webster, 2024c). Swettenham replaces the Latin “*otium*” with “*opium*” to draw the readers’ attention to the Sultan’s hobby of opium smoking during his free time. As can be seen, the Latin phrase itself is not retained in the Malay translation. The Malay-speaking readers are told that the Sultan cared only about his “*istirahat dan kesenangan*” (lit. relaxation and comfort), which can be seen as an approximation of the original Latin phrase. This Malay equivalent, however, does little to convey the Sultan’s fondness for opium, as intended by Swettenham through his skillful

use of wordplay in *MS*. It cannot be determined, however, whether the translators are aware of the wordplay but chose not to foreground the Sultan's fondness for opium in their translation, or whether they are unaware of the wordplay in *MS*.

### 4.3 The Italian Word in *MS*

The sole Italian word in *MS* is deleted altogether in the Malay translation, as shown in the example in Table 13.

Table 13: Deletion of L3

ST	TT
The road itself is cut through soil of a deep shade of <i>terra cotta</i> , the colour all the more vivid by reason of the hues of green by which it is environed. (p. 282)	Denai itu terbentuk di tanah liat yang terhampar, warnanya terang disebabkan biasan rona-rona hijau yang mengelilinginya. (p. 188)

In this excerpt taken from the final chapter of *MS*, Swettenham talks about the land of the Malay people, particularly about a road that cuts through soil the colour of “*terra cotta*”. The Italian word “*terra cotta*” refers to “hard, baked, red-brown clay” (Cambridge University Press, 2009). In the context of the excerpt in Table 13, it can be understood then that the soil is reddish-brown in colour. In the Malay translation, neither is the Italian word “*terra cotta*” retained, nor reference to the reddish-brown colour carried across.

Based on the analysis carried out, it can be said that the translation of L3 in French, Latin and Italian in *MS* involves the substitution of L3 (case 3), the retention of L3 (case 2) and the deletion of L3 (case 1). The use of these operations by the translators of *MS* is summarised in Table 14.

Table 14: Operations used in the translation of L3 in *Malay Sketches*

	Retention $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L3^{TT}$	Substitution $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$	Deletion $L3^{ST} \rightarrow \emptyset$
French	3	13	3
Latin	1	5	-
Italian	-	-	1

Through the use of substitution, in which  $L3^{ST}$  is replaced with the language of the translation,  $L3^{ST}$  is neutralised and is no longer visible as a third language in the translation. Likewise,

through the use of deletion, L3<sup>ST</sup> is removed altogether and can no longer be observed in the translation. Very few L3<sup>ST</sup> are actually retained to become L3<sup>TT</sup>. Clearly, the solutions taken by the translators result in translation loss, defined by Hervey and Higgins (1992) as “non-replication of the ST in the TT” (p. 21). It should, however, be emphasised that it is through substitution that the meaning of L3 becomes clearer in most of the cases. Therefore, while translation loss is unavoidable, this study underlines the importance of achieving balance between loss (of ST features) and gains (of meaning and clarity) in translation.

It must also be noted that the findings of this study contrast markedly with the findings of the study by Haroon and Daud (2017), in which L3<sup>ST</sup> are mostly repeated in L2, resulting in a translation which retains the multilingual features of the source text. It is posited that the nature and function of the L3 may influence the operation(s) used. In the case of *MS*, L3<sup>ST</sup> are words and expressions which convey concepts and ideas. As such, translating them into L2 would be able to convey the meaning much more clearly. In contrast, L3<sup>ST</sup> in the study by Haroon and Daud (2017) are mostly culture-specific references. By retaining the L3 in the Malay translation, the translator is able to foreground the foreign elements, as intended by the author of the source text. While it is clear from these two studies that the nature and function of L3 may influence the operation(s) used in translating L3, more studies are needed to explore this in greater depth before definitive conclusions can be reached.

## 5.0 CONCLUSION

This study explored how L3 words and expressions in French, Latin and Italian in a source text in English entitled *Malay Sketches* are dealt with when the text is translated into Malay, and discussed the effects resulting from the solutions taken by the translators. The findings point to substitution as the most frequently used operation in the translation of L3 in *Malay Sketches*. L3 is standardised, resulting in the invisibility of foreign words and expressions in the Malay translation. Consequently, one defining feature of the source text, which is the presence of a variety of languages, can no longer be observed in the Malay translation. By highlighting the operations taken and the resulting effect, this study hopes to be able to contribute to and expand current discourse on L3 in translation, especially in the context of translation in Malaysia. Further research could look into the presence of L3 in other genres to examine whether genre may influence the operations employed in dealing with L3 in translation.

## REFERENCES

- Bellos, D. (2008). The awkward issue of L3. *Yearbook of Comparative and General Literature*, 54, 114-120.
- Cambridge University Press. (2009). *Terra cotta*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/terra-cotta>
- Cambridge University Press. (2014a). *Séance*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/french-english/seance>
- Cambridge University Press. (2014b). *Séance*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/seance>
- Cambridge University Press. (2014c). *Sujet*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/french-english/sujet>
- Cambridge University Press. (2018a). *Bouillabaisse*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/french-english/bouillabaisse>
- Cambridge University Press. (2018b). *Métier*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/french-english/metier>
- Cambridge University Press. (2018c). *Mésalliance*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/french-english/mesalliance>
- Cambridge University Press. (2020a). *Hors de combat*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/hors-de-combat>
- Cambridge University Press. (2020b). *Terra incognita*. Cambridge Dictionary.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/terra-incognita>
- Corrius, M., & Zabalbeascoa, P. (2011). Language variation in source texts and their translations: The case of L3 in film translation. *Target*, 23(1), 113-130.
- Ebrahimzadeh Poustchi, M., & Amirian, Z. (2021). Strategies used in dubbing multilingual movies into Persian. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 42(6), 475-488.
- European Dictionary. (2024). *Laudator temporis acti*. EUdict.  
<https://eudict.com/?lang=lateng&word=laudator+temporis+acti>
- Franco Aixelá, J. F. (1996). Culture-specific items in translation. In R. Alvarez & C.A. Vidal (Eds.), *Translation, power, subversion* (pp. 52-78). Multilingual Matters.
- Golchinnezhad, M., & Amirian, Z. (2022). Dubbing multilingual movies into Persian: A case of invented languages as the third language. *Perspectives: Studies in Translation Theory and Practice*, 30(4), 727-741.

- Grutman, R. (2000). Multilingualism and translation. In M. Baker (Ed.), *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies* (pp. 157-160). Routledge.
- Grutman, R. (2006). Refraction and recognition: Literary multilingualism in translation. *Target*, 18(1), 17–47.
- Haroon, H., & Daud, N. S. (2017). The translation of foreign words in an English novel into Malay. *GEMA Online® Journal of Language Studies*, 17(1), 163-181.
- Hervey, S., & Higgins, I. (1992). *Thinking French translation: A course in translation method, French to English* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Routledge.
- Hosseini, K. (2008). *A thousand splendid suns*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- José, F. S. (1988). *Ermita*. Solidaridad Publishing House.
- Khoshsaligheh, M., Eriss, A., Mehdizadkhani, M., & Pakar, E. (2024). Translation of multilingual films in Iran in Persian dubbing. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 21(3), 1218-1238.
- Merriam-Webster. (2024a). *Bravo*. Merriam-Webster. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/bravo>
- Merriam-Webster. (2024b). *Laudator temporis acti*. Merriam-Webster. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/laudator%20temporis%20acti>
- Merriam-Webster. (2024c). *Otium cum dignitate*. Merriam-Webster. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/otium%20cum%20dignitate>
- Munday, J., Ramos Pinto, S., & Blakesley, J. (2022). *Introducing translation studies: Theories and applications* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Routledge.
- Swettenham, F. A. (1903). *Malay sketches* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). The Bodley Head.
- Voellmer, E. (2014). When Herman the German becomes Erik der Wikinger: Heterolingualism in US sitcoms and their German dubbed versions. In A.W. Khalifa (Ed.), *Translators have their say? Translation and the power of agency: Selected papers of the CETRA Research Summer School 2013* (pp. 153-173). LIT Verlag.
- Zabalbeascoa, P., & Voellmer, E. (2014). Accounting for multilingual films in translation studies: Intratextual translation in dubbing. In D. Abend-David (Ed.), *Media and translation: An interdisciplinary approach* (pp. 25–52). Bloomsbury Academic.

## APPENDIX

### L3 in *Malay Sketches* and their counterparts in the Malay translation

No.	L3	Malay Equivalent
<b>FRENCH</b>		
1	<i>mésalliances</i>	perkahwinan yang tidak sekufu
2	<i>bouille-abaisse</i>	<i>bouille-abaisse</i> (footnote provided)
3	<i>venue</i>	tempat
4	<i>sujets</i>	<i>sujets</i>
5	<i>liaison</i>	hubungan
		melakukan sesuatu yang tidak elok
6	<i>métier</i>	-
7	<i>dénouement</i>	-
8	<i>impasse</i>	jalan buntu
9	<i>hors de combat</i>	tiada daya lagi melawan semula
10	<i>séance</i>	<i>séance</i> atau upacara puja semangat untuk berbicara
11	<i>hauteur</i>	kesombongan
12	<i>suave</i>	peramah
13	<i>rôle</i>	-
14	<i>cordon</i>	kepungan
15	<i>mêlée</i>	huru-hara
16	<i>qui vive</i>	sedang diawasi
17	<i>en evidence</i>	berada di tempat yang terdedah
18	<i>en masse</i>	beramai-ramai
19	<i>rose dorée</i>	warna bak mawar yang sedang mekar
<b>LATIN</b>		
20	<i>post-mortem</i>	bedah siasat
21	<i>opium cum dignitate</i>	istirahat dan kesenangan
22	<i>spretæ injuria formæ</i>	dikecam akibat kecantikannya
23	<i>laudator temporis acti</i>	orang menganggap yang lama lebih cantik daripada yang baru
24	<i>modus operandi</i>	tatacara
25	<i>terra incognita</i>	<i>terra incognita</i> (footnote provided)
<b>ITALIAN</b>		
26	<i>terra cotta</i>	-